

THE PIPER'S WARNING TO HIS MASTER. (Cholla mo run)

In dealing with this tune it is not proposed to give a full analysis, which would occupy far too much space, but one in tabular form only. The first 16 bars (8:) are omitted, as all versions

agree in the main features. From this the diligent student can, should he so desire, make up a full analysis.

THIRD PART.

FOURTH PART.

Analysis Division Nos.	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28	29	30	31	32	33	34	35	36	37	38
"Ceol Mor" Version—Bar Nos.	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28	29	30	31	32
MacDonald's do.	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28	29	30	31	32	33	34	35	36	37	38
MacKay's do.	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28	29	30	..
Compiler's Correction do.	17	18	19½	20	..	20½	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28	29	30	31	32

Donald MacDonald's version has 38 bars, Angus MacKay's 30. General Thomason in his "Concluding Remarks" in "Ceol Mor" says—"The commonest faults in the Pibrochs which have come down to us is naturally that of omitted bars, which is scarcely to be wondered at when we consider the past history of this music. . . . If we take as an example the Pibroch *A Cholla mo run* it will well illustrate how useful the establishment of metres has been to me in the editing. A. MacKay makes this out as having a metre of 8 : 6.8. which to my ear always showed a deficiency somewhere. When we come to write it out line by line, it becomes clear that the deficiency is in the third line. Two more bars here would make this an equal metre Pibroch and the question was from whence these two bars were to be obtained. I could not insert them as the work of Editor without being able to quote some authority. I appealed in vain to MacDonald's MSS. but found his metre hopeless. I did, however, there find, just where I have placed them, the two bars marked (a) and (b) and this at once makes sense of an air which, as hitherto played even by the best pipers, strikes me as quite pointless." General Thomason's bars (a) and (b) are MacDonald's bars 20 and 21, and it is clear he has not inserted the right ones, when the full analysis is carefully considered.

The clue will be found by arranging the Singling of Taorluith in parts, thus—(MacKay's bar numbers.)

PART I.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
do. II.	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16
do. III.	17	18	19	*	*	20	21	22
do. IV.	23	24	25	26	27	28	29	30

The missing bars * are, of course, between his 19th and 20th.

The underlined bars all finish with a g.e.d. cadence to B, followed, through the little finger, by A. It is fairly obvious the first missing bar should be the same. We have the choice, amongst the underlined bars, of those commencing with a B Taorluith beat, as Nos. 4 and 12, or commencing with a D beat, as do the other underlined ones. It will be clear the D beat is indicated, for bar 19 finishes with E, whereas bar 3 finishes with D and indicates B to open No. 4. This being so we require a bar similar to his 20 in both Ground and Variations. That will be found in the first half of MacDonald's No. 20 and the last half of his No. 22. Indeed, this probably accounts for the error in his version—the player after wrongly getting on D at the end of his bar 20 has had to play two bars to get back to B! The same error, exactly, occurs in MacDonald's bars 32, 33 and 34. The fact that MacKay's first missing bar and his 20th are the same probably accounts for his omission—the player has jumped from the real 20th to the real 23rd and then finished the part.

MacDonald's other excess bars, his Nos. 23 and 24, are possibly caused by the player's error in jumping from the third line to the fourth, and instead of playing real bar 21 he has jumped to the corresponding bar in the next part, but has not finished it correctly—played the G instead of E (as in the opening of the part). Then finding himself again playing the opening strain, he has gone on till he reached the correct (bar 27, the same as 21) and then finished correctly.

The revised tune given here in staff notation follows the style of MacDonald, but is re-timed after the style in "Ceol Mor," which is better in this respect than the others. It is interesting as showing just the differences between the parts which might be expected in a primitive 4 : 4.4 tune of this kind.

The Taorluith for bars 20 and 21 should be D, B and E, E respectively. Played MacKay's way the last half of bar 20 would be a g.e.d. cadence to B, then through the little finger to A.