

LAMENT FOR FINLAY MOR.

Division No. 1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
Mac Donald.								
Mac Kay.								
Glen.								

THE above is an Analysis of three versions of the last line of this tune—Donald MacDonald's, Angus MacKay's and Glen's, the latter being MacKay's version with two bars added. The tune is clearly of 8 : 8.8. metre, but MacDonald has only seven bars in the last line of his Ground as against eight in his Taorluth. MacKay has only six bars, both in Ground and Taorluth. Glen's version has eight bars in both Ground and Taorluth, but his additions are open to question.

Before dealing with the completion or correction of the last line it is necessary to point out that in all versions there is something incorrect in the seventh bar of the Second line. In this position (seventh) the bar, neither Ground nor Taorluth Singling, can finish with a two-note beat! Every other bar finishes this way, and the only other possible place, other than the even numbered bars, where such a two-note beat is permissible, would be in the fifth bar of the last line, for the reason it is not unusual to find changes of such a kind in the third quarter of a part, especially the last part. Musically, the second half of the seventh bar would seem to require D and the following is probably the correct beat, which it will be noticed, agrees the last half of the seventh bar of the other lines. It might be remarked that in MacDonald's version the first half of this seventh bar would be better if made the same as MacKay's. Perhaps the error in the last half is responsible for MacDonald's first half! Regarding the singling of Taorluth, this should, of course, consist of two regular Taorluth beats, E and D.

Coming now to the completion or revision of the last line, attention is drawn to the following points in the analysis. It seems clear that in all versions there is a missing bar after the first two, (*vide* remarks as to even numbered bars ending with a two-note beat). Division 3 is therefore left blank as regards the Ground bars. Placing MacKay's version under MacDonald's (which is complete save for the third bar) makes clear, it is considered, the position of the two missing Ground bars in MacKay (Divisions 3 and 6). It also seems clear that MacKay's Taorluth bars are correctly placed in the analysis, for his third bar to take fourth place would require to end in a two-note beat. On the other hand his fifth bar is placed in Division 6 because it does not fit the Ground in Division 8. In Division 6 it requires to be amended to end with a two-note beat. Glen inserts two bars (Divisions 6 and 7). That in Division 7 is clearly excess, for his third bar really takes fourth place and in that position agrees similar bars in the other lines.

The following suggestions for completing and correcting the versions are offered—

MACDONALD. Division 3.
This seems musically correct and agrees with the Taorluth bar.

MACKAY. Division 3. The first suggestion is—

This fits the Taorluth and is musically correct and, moreover, is a play upon the similar bar in the first line.

Other suggestions are—

These seem musically correct but do not fit the Taorluth.

For Division 6, which should end in a two-note beat, the following would agree the Taorluth (the last half bar of which should be the same as the Ground) and would be musically correct—

The following would be musically correct also—

(the latter as in Glen's version), but would not agree the Taorluth based on G and E.

The Taorluth for Division 8 should consist of E and D beats, to agree the Ground, as the similar bar in the First Line.

GLEN. This version, as already indicated, is MacKay's with two bars added (Divisions 6 and 7). For reasons already stated we cannot place Glen's third bar in the third place and it is consequently clear his sixth bar (Division 7) is wrongly inserted. His fifth bar in sixth place is musically correct but does not agree MacKay's Taorluth (Division 6) which Glen places as the seventh bar (Division 8).